

CITY OF SAN JOSÉ, CALIFORNIA
Department of Planning, Building and Code Enforcement
200 E. Santa Clara Street
San José, California 95113-7905

Hearing Date/Agenda Number
H.L.C. 10/04/06 Item No.: 5. b.

File Number
GP06-07-03; PDC06-015

Application Type
General Plan Amendment & Planned Dev. Rezoning

Council District SNI
7 NA

Planning Area
Monterey Corridor

Assessor's Parcel Number(s)
497-33-004, -006

STAFF REPORT

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Completed by: Allen Tai, Reena Mathew

Location: Southeast corner of Monterey Road and Umbarger Road

Gross Acreage: 3.17 Net Acreage: 3.04 Net Density: 19.73 DU/AC

Existing Zoning: IP Industrial Park Existing Uses: Palm Tree Inn and Bay Area Lumber Fence and Deck Co.

Proposed Zoning: A(PD) Planned Development Proposed Use: 60 Single-family attached residential units

GENERAL PLAN

Completed by: AT

Existing Land Use/Transportation Diagram Designations

Combined Industrial/Commercial

Project Conformance:
 Yes No
 See Analysis and Recommendations

SURROUNDING LAND USES AND ZONING

Completed by: AT

North: Used car sales lot; County Fairgrounds

Unincorporated County

East: Various light industrial uses

Industrial Park

South: City animal shelter

Industrial Park

West: Mobile home park across Monterey Road

A (PD) Planned Development (7.5 DU/AC)

ENVIRONMENTAL STATUS

Completed by: AT

Environmental Impact Report found complete
 Negative Declaration circulated on
 Negative Declaration adopted on

Exempt
 Environmental Review Incomplete

FILE HISTORY

Completed by: AT

Annexation Title: Franklin No_38

Date: 12/10/1985

PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION

Recommend Approval
 Recommend Approval with Conditions
 Recommend Denial

Date _____

Approved by: _____

CURRENT OWNER

Raman and Ruxmaniben Patel
2724 Monterey Road
San Jose, CA 95111

DEVELOPER

John Moniz
Pinn Brothers Fine Homes
1475 Saratoga Ave., Suite 250
San Jose, CA 95129

ARCHITECT

Viviana Deloera
KTYG Group, Inc.
17992 Mitchell South
Irvine, CA 92614

PUBLIC AGENCY COMMENTS RECEIVED

Completed by: AT

- Non-applicable

Other Departments and Agencies

- Non-applicable

GENERAL CORRESPONDENCE

- None received.

ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**BACKGROUND**

In March 2006, the applicant, John Moniz of Pinn Brothers, submitted an application for a General Plan Amendment on a 2.4 gross acre site to change the Land Use/Transportation Diagram designation on the site from Combined Industrial Commercial to Medium High Density Residential (12-25 DU/AC). The proposal also included a Planned Development Rezoning located at the southeast corner of Monterey Road and Umbarger Road, to allow the development of 44 single-family attached residential units. The proposal was subsequently revised in September 2006 to increase the site to 3.17 gross acres to allow development of up to 60 single-family attached residential units. The subject site is surrounded by commercial/industrial uses to the south and east, a mobile home park to the west, and the County Fairgrounds to the north.

The proposed project includes the demolition of the Palm Tree Inn motel structure and two accessory buildings, including a barn and tank house. The accessory buildings originated from the agricultural use on the site prior to development of the existing motel. The Historic Evaluation concluded that the two accessory buildings do not qualify to be listed on the City of San Jose Historical Resources Inventory (HRI), because they have been relocated from their original location and the context of the agricultural uses on the site have long been lost. Therefore, the focus of this report is regarding the proposed demolition of the Palm Tree Inn motel structure.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

An Initial Study is being prepared for this project and the Director of Planning, Building, and Code Enforcement anticipates that the project will receive a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND). The project's potential impacts on cultural resources are currently being analyzed in the environmental review. Based on the historical and architectural evaluation prepared for the site, the existing buildings and site do not appear to qualify for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) and/or the California Register of Historical Resources (CRHR), or on the City of San Jose Historic Resources Inventory (HRI) as a Candidate City Landmark or Contributing Structure to a City Landmark Historic District. Hence, demolition to accommodate future development at the site is not anticipated to have a significant effect on the environment in the context of historic resources as defined by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines

Section 15064.5. A more comprehensive accounting of the environmental mitigation measures will be presented as part of the Mitigated Negative Declaration for this project. Staff anticipates that circulation of the Mitigated Negative Declaration will commence in mid-October.

GENERAL PLAN CONFORMANCE

The City identifies historic resources through surveys, either independently funded surveys of thematic or geographic areas, or individual property surveys required as part of development review. The Palm Tree Inn, barn and tank house, were evaluated using the City's Historic Evaluation Criteria (Tally) Form. The evaluation indicates that the Palm Tree Inn would meet the threshold for listing as a Structure of Merit with a score of 47.26. The rating for the barn and tank house is 15.76 and therefore they do not qualify for listing in the Inventory. As a qualifying Structure of Merit, the Palm Tree Inn structure is being referred to the HLC for consideration in the development review process in conformance with HACR Policy No. 1, for recommendation regarding the disposition of the historic resource to the decision making body. Project conditions identified in the Analysis section of this report may be part of this consideration. The HLC may also consider recommending the addition of the property to the Historic Resources Inventory or noting its impact on the Inventory in conformance with HACR Policy No. 3.

Urban Conservation/Preservation Major Strategy

The San Jose 2020 General Plan Urban Conservation/Preservation Major Strategy states that at a strategic level, preservation activities contribute visual evidence to a sense of community that grows out of the roots of San Jose's past. As a subset of that strategy, the Historic, Archaeological and Cultural Resources (HACR) Goal includes preservation of historically and archaeologically structures of varying significance in order to promote a greater sense of historic awareness and community identity, and to enhance the quality of urban living. The Preservation of historic structures identified as Structures of Merit is addressed in the following HACR Policies:

- Policy No. 1 Because historically or archaeologically significant sites, structures and districts are irreplaceable resources, their preservation should be a key consideration in the development review process.
- Policy No. 3 An inventory of historically and/or architecturally significant structures should be maintained and periodically updated in order to promote awareness of these community resources.
- Policy No. 4 Areas with a concentration of historically and/or architecturally significant sites or structures should be considered for preservation through the creation of Historic Preservation Districts.

Land Use/Transportation Diagram

The site currently has a General Plan land use designation of Combined Industrial/Commercial, which is intended for commercial, office, or industrial developments or a compatible mixture of these uses. The site is part of a larger area identified as the Monterey Corridor 2 Fiscal Study Subarea. According to the *Framework, as a Guideline, to Evaluate Proposed Conversions of Employment Lands to Other Uses*, conversions of industrial lands in the Monterey Corridor area should generally be discouraged. The project vicinity is also a designated Enterprise Zone, which is a specific geographic area targeted for economic revitalization. Enterprise

Zones encourage economic growth and investment in distressed areas by offering tax advantages and incentives to businesses locating within the zone boundaries. The applicant requests re-designation of the site to Medium High Density Residential (12-25 DU/AC) in order to facilitate the development of up to 60 single family attached residences.

HISTORIC RESOURCE EVALUATION

A historic report, entitled “Historical and Architectural Evaluation Palm Tree Inn” dated August 18, 2003 was completed by the Dill Design Group and submitted with the project in March 2006. The historic report, which includes the State of California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) forms, and associated City of San Jose Tally form, is attached to this report.

Description

The historic report states the existing structure at 2724 Monterey Road is a single story, U-shaped structure that consists of an office and two wings of rooms flanking a central entry and parking area. The structure was originally constructed in 1946 in the Neo-Spanish Colonial Revival architectural style. According to the historic report, the design of the motel is distinctive, and shows an artistic attempt to overlay a thematic revival style related to the Spanish and Mexican rancho designs in early California history. The original design featured a segmented U-shaped building that is broken by an uncovered passageway to the south of the office, which located at the center of the U. A U-shaped driveway provides access from Monterey Road, and parking is provided along the driveway in open carports directly in front of the motel rooms. However, physical alterations that occurred during the 1950s and 1960s, including the elimination of the carports and modifications to the windows and doors, have compromised the initial design.

Associations

The Palm Tree Inn motel is one of many auto-oriented structures that provided lodging to people traveling along Monterey Road. The motel was designed to be reminiscent of the large rancho headquarters of early California, and it represents a popular 1920s-1940s marketing scheme to draw visiting travelers to the motel. The original structure would therefore be associated with the evolution of auto-oriented lodging in the greater San Jose area. However, due to significant alterations, including the elimination of the carports and modifications to the windows and doors, the structure does not retain sufficient integrity to convey its association with an organization or historic development patterns.

Integrity

The California Register of Historical Resources (CRHR) interprets the integrity of a cultural resource based upon its physical authenticity. A property that is eligible for the California Register of Historical Resources for its historic association must retain the essential physical features that made up its character or appearance during the period of its association in order to convey its significance. The historic evaluation reflects the conclusion that the Palm Tree Inn fails to retain its original integrity. Although the structure originally represents one of the most distinctive designs of the auto-oriented lodging period, the replacement of the original carports with additional motel rooms in the 1950s and 1960s has sufficiently compromised the integrity of the original design. Furthermore, subsequent alterations and retrofits, including the elimination of the carports and modifications to the windows and doors, were not done in a way that maintained the original architectural features and detailing. Therefore, the structure no longer adequately conveys its origins

associated with the evolution of auto-oriented lodging.

Significance

The structure is not currently listed on the City of San Jose Historical Resources Inventory (HRI). The structure appears to be eligible for listing in the San Jose Historic Resources Inventory as a Structure of Merit, but not as a Candidate City Landmark or as a Contributing Structure to a City Landmark Historic District. The structure does not appear to meet the criteria for listing on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) and/or the California Register of Historical Resources (CRHR) because of the lack of clearly identifiable associations and the loss of integrity that is necessary to convey its historic significance as a motel during that era of auto-oriented lodging development in the greater San Jose area.

Impacts

Because the building and site do not appear to qualify for listing on the NRHP and/or CRHR, or on the HRI as a Candidate City Landmark or Contributing Structure to a City Landmark Historic District, demolition to accommodate future development at the site would not have a significant effect on the environment in the context of historic resources as defined by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15064.5. In addition, the report proposes the use of photo documentation to address the loss of the site that is eligible to be categorized as a "Structure of Merit". While not required mitigation, project conditions that include photo documentation in conjunction with allowing for the salvage of materials would lessen the loss of local history and preserve historical information.

ANALYSIS

The primary project issues for the Historic Landmarks Commission are maintenance of the Historic Resources Inventory and recommendations regarding the disposition of the Historic Resources identified on the project site.

Historic Resources Inventory Maintenance

In 1986, the City Council passed Resolution No. 58957 authorizing the Historic Landmarks Commission and its staff to maintain the Historic Resources Inventory, which identifies known historic resources of varying significance. A Historic Resource can be identified as eligible for the National and/or California Register according to federal and state criteria. A Candidate City Landmark is a highly significant historic resource meeting the qualifications for landmark designation as defined in the Historic Preservation Ordinance. A Structure of Merit is a special historic resource that does not merit City Landmark designation, but contributes to the historic fabric of a neighborhood and the City and is eligible for inclusion in the HRI. City Council Resolution No. 58957 authorizes the Commission and its staff to utilize the Inventory as a foundation for future designation of City Landmarks and Historic Districts and for the review and evaluation of proposed development on sites throughout the City.

The City does not have the resources to conduct a comprehensive historic resource survey of San Jose, however, non-surveyed individual sites are identified as part of the environmental review process. While historic resources identified as significant under the California Environmental Quality Act (appearing to be eligible for the California Register or as Candidate City Landmarks) are reviewed by the Landmarks Commission through the environmental review process, resources identified as Structures of Merit are referred to the Commission as part of the Commission's authority in maintaining and utilizing the Inventory. This

referral process informs the Commission about development of sites that may be eligible for the HRI and/or areas of the City that have not been surveyed.

Historic Resource Recommendations

While the existing structure, considered eligible for listing as a Structure of Merit, is proposed for demolition is not considered to be a historic resource under CEQA, it does play a role in preserving the City's historic fabric. Should the Historic Landmarks Commission not support the proposed demolition of the historic resource, the Commission can recommend the structure be added to the Historic Resources Inventory, and project alternatives, including rehabilitation and reuse of the structure be considered.

Should the Commission support the demolition of the structure in order to meet the project objectives, the Commission can recommend project conditions in order to lessen the loss of local history and preserve historical information. Because the demolition would not trigger a significant impact under CEQA, these recommendations would not be required environmental mitigation measures. Instead, these would be project level conditions agreed to by the applicant and incorporated into any approvals at the Planned Development (PD) Rezoning stage in the process. Project conditions could include: advertising the structure for relocation, with the developer contributing towards relocation a dollar amount equivalent to demolition cost; offering the structure for salvage opportunities prior to any demolition activities if relocation is not successful and providing archival (non-HABS) level photographic documentation for the structure and site for storage at the History San Jose library, and the California Room; contributing to historic resource survey work in the Monterey Corridor; and/or contributing to the creation of an online and/or History San Jose library educational exhibit documenting the history of the site and Monterey Road.

COMMUNITY OUTREACH

The project was presented at a Community Meeting on May 16, 2006 in order to discuss the proposed project and solicit feedback from the community. Five members of the nearby mobile home community were present for the meeting, and they were generally supportive of the proposed project.

This Staff Report has been available on the Planning Divisions web site, and staff has been available to discuss the project with interested members of the public.

RECOMMENDATION

Planning Staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) make recommendations to the Director of Planning, Planning Commission, and City Council regarding the identified Structure of Merit located on the existing site.

Should the HLC not support the demolition of the identified Structures of Merit, recommend project alternatives that include some or all of the following:

1. Rehabilitation and reuse of the Structure of Merit
2. Listing the Structure of Merit on the Historic Resources Inventory

No environmental mitigation is required as a part of the proposed project. However, should the HLC support the demolition of the identified Structure of Merit, the HLC could recommend some or all of the following project conditions in order to respond to community concern about the history of the site:

1. Advertise the identified Structure of Merit for relocation, with the developer contributing towards relocation a dollar amount equivalent to demolition cost,
2. Advertise the identified Structure of Merit for salvage opportunities to local historic organizations and salvage companies prior to any demolition activities if relocation is not successful,
3. Submit archival (non-HABS) level photographic documentation for the identified Structures of Merit, to the Historic Preservation Officer for storage at the History San Jose library, and the California Room.
4. Contribute to historic resource survey work in the Monterey Corridor, and/or
5. Contribute to the creation of an online and/or History of San Jose library educational exhibit documenting the history of the site and Monterey Road.

Attachments

\\Pbce001\Implementation\PLANNING FILES\Zonings\2006\PDC06-015 HLC SR.doc