



## **HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION**

### ***SYNOPSIS***

**WEDNESDAY APRIL 4, 2007**

San Jose 2020 General Plan Update Work Session

5:00-5:45 P.M.

Tower, Room T-332

Regular Session

6:00 P.M.

Council Wing, Room W-118/119

200 East Santa Clara Street

San Jose, CA

### **COMMISSION MEMBERS**

**EDWARD JANKE, AIA, CHAIR**

**PATRICIA COLOMBE, VICE CHAIR**

**HELENE LAVELLE    SCOTT CUNNINGHAM**

**DANA PEAK    JUDY STABILE**

**ERIC THACKER**

**JOSEPH HORWEDEL, DIRECTOR  
DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, BUILDING AND CODE ENFORCEMENT**

## NOTE

To arrange an accommodation under the Americans with Disabilities Act to participate in this public meeting, we ask that you call (408) 535-7800 (VOICE) or (408) 998-5299 (TTY) at least two business days before the meeting.

## NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC

Good evening, my name is **Pat Colombe**, and I am the Vice Chair of the Historic Landmarks Commission. On behalf of the Commission, I would like to welcome you to tonight's meeting. I will now call to order the April 4, 2007 meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission. Please remember to turn off your cell phones and pagers.

If you want to address the Commission, **fill out a speaker card (located at the technician's station), and give the completed card to the technician. Please include the agenda item number for reference.**

**The procedure for public hearings is as follows:**

- After the staff report, *applicants may make a five-minute presentation.*
- Anyone wishing to speak in favor of the proposal should prepare to come forward. After the proponents speak, anyone wishing to speak in opposition should prepare to come forward. *Each speaker will have two minutes.*
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Commission will then close the public hearing. The Historic Landmarks Commission will take action on the item.

**The procedure for referrals is as follows:**

- Anyone wishing to speak on a referral should prepare to come forward. *Each speaker will have one minute.*
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Historic Landmarks Commission will comment on the referral item.

**If a Commissioner would like a topic to be addressed under one of the Good and Welfare items, please contact Planning staff in advance of the Commission meeting.**

An agenda and a copy of all staff reports have been placed on the table for your convenience.

**AGENDA**  
**ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**6:00 PM SESSION**

**1. ROLL CALL**

*All present except Janke.*

**2. DEFERRALS**

Any item scheduled for hearing this evening for which deferral is being requested will be taken out of order to be heard first on the matter of deferral. If you want to change any of the deferral dates recommended or speak to the question of deferring these or any other items, you should say so at this time.

**The matter of deferrals is now closed.**

**3. CONSENT CALENDAR**

**NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC**

**The consent calendar items are considered to be routine and will be adopted by one motion. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a request is made by a member of the Historic Landmarks Commission, staff or the public to have an item removed from the consent calendar and considered separately. If anyone in the audience wishes to speak on one of these items, please make your request at this time.**

- a. **APPROVAL OF THE MARCH 7, 2007 AND MARCH 21, 2007 HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SYNOPSES.**

**The Consent Calendar is now closed.**

**APPROVED (6-0-1; JANKE ABSENT)**

#### 4. **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

- a. **SP07-011**. **Special Use Permit** to demolish an existing single-family residence, listed as an Identified Structure in the Hester/Hanchett Conservation Area, in order to allow a new, approximately 2,256 square-foot single-family residence with tandem parking located on the southeast side of Magnolia Avenue, approximately 590 feet southwesterly of The Alameda (1204 Magnolia Avenue) (Feliciano Brito, owner). Council District 6. SNI: None. CEQA: Exempt.

**Staff Recommendation:**

Historic Landmarks Commission forward a recommendation to the Director of Planning regarding the disposition of the existing residence and consider adoption of a Resolution amending the designation of the Property from Identified Structure (IS) to Non-Contributing Structure (NCS) on the City of San Jose Historic Resources Inventory.

*Commissioner Cunningham noted that some window or door openings into the portecochere area might potentially need to be revised at the building permit stage.*

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION APPROVED (6-0-1; JANKE ABSENT)**

#### 5. **REFERRALS FROM CITY COUNCIL, BOARDS, COMMISSIONS OR OTHER AGENCIES**

- a. **Discussion regarding deaccessioning items from City Collections Deaccession list**

*Monica Tucker, collections manager for History SJ discussed how deaccessioned items are offered to other nonprofits, educational groups, or offered at public auction. Commissioner Cunningham and Vice Chair Colombe encouraged the provision of a local location and advertising for any auctioning that may occur.*

**MEMO FOR DEACCESSION APPROVED (6-0-1; JANKE ABSENT)**

- b. **PDC06-100**. **Planned Development Rezoning** from R-1-8 Single Family Residence Zoning District and A(PD) Planned Development Zoning Districts to A(PD) Planned Development Zoning District to allow relocation of one single-family residence (California Register eligible Structure of Merit), two new single-family detached residences, and parking lot reconfiguration for the Central YMCA on a 4.18 gross acre site (Metropolitan YMCA, LeBaron, owners). Council District 6. SNI: None. CEQA: In Process.

**Staff Recommendation:**

Historic Landmarks Commission to forward a recommendation to the Planning Commission and City Council regarding the disposition of the historic resource located on the site.

*Commissioner Lavelle recused herself from discussion of this item.*

*Commissioner Cunningham inquired about the possibility of removing existing non-historic additions without needing to relocate the building, as well as the possibility of building one*

*additional new unit on the site while leaving the historic house in place. Ray Hashimoto, the project proponent, stated that new units are necessary for the project to be economically feasible and to accomplish renovation of the historic house, and that it is necessary to move the building in order to fit the two new houses on the site. Commissioners raised concerns regarding landscaping and tree removal, including a large Deodar cedar close to the front property line. Staff clarified that the Historic Evaluation concluded that landscape elements do not appear to be fundamental to the property's historical significance.*

*Other points of discussion included the costs and logistical difficulties associated with renovation of the historic house, potential setting of precedent for other large parcels in the Rose Garden area, and compatibility between the sizes of the proposed lots and houses (also with regard to their compatibility with the existing development pattern in the neighborhood).*

*Corri Jimenez, PAC SJ, spoke in support of the project. She concurred with the staff report and encouraged making the project's landscape elements compatible with neighboring context. She also recommended compatibility with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, especially with regard to massing and differentiation, and recommended relocating the historic house adjacent to the other existing homes on the block.*

**MOTION TO FORWARD THE FOLLOWING RECOMMENDATIONS  
APPROVED (5-0-1-1; JANKE ABSENT, LAVELLE ABSTAINING):**

- 1. The project's landscaping (for the historic house and the new units), as well as the scale and massing of the new house, should reflect the period of significance for the area (1920s) and be consistent with neighborhood pattern.**
  - 2. The Planned Development Permit should come back before HLC prior to approval by the Director of Planning.**
- c. **PDC03-108. Planned Development Rezoning** from A(PD) Planned Development Zoning District to A(PD) Planned Development Zoning District to allow up to 1,232 single-family residences and 304,920 square feet for commercial uses on a 120.4 gross acre site, located on both side of Berryessa Road just west of Union Pacific Railroad tracks (San Jose Flea Market). (The Flea Market, Inc, owner) Council District 4. SNI: None. CEQA: EIR.

**Staff Recommendation:**

Historic Landmarks Commission to forward comments to the Planning Commission and City Council regarding the disposition of the identified cultural resource located on the site.

*Commission discussion addressed the possibility of having an open-air market-like element placed somewhere on the site. Commissioners noted a discrepancy between the plan set and the accompanying text regarding the acreages shown for different land uses (e.g., open space), and expressed concern that open-air markets are not an enumerated land use in the zoning ordinance. Staff noted that because the proposed project is a planned development rezoning, the allowed land uses could be tailored. Other Commission discussion included concerns that*

*reduced-size market would be unlikely to reflect the current resource and would be incompatible with the BART project.*

**MOTION TO REITERATE PREVIOUS HLC COMMENTS ON THE DEIR AND TO EXPRESS SUPPORT FOR RELOCATION OF THE FLEA MARKET ACTIVITY TO ANOTHER SITE, OR PARTIAL PRESERVATION ON-SITE APPROVED (4-2-1; THACKER AND CUNNINGHAM OPPOSED, JANKE ABSENT).**

- d. [Discussion of BART Station Entrance option M1-B](#), in the Bank of Italy Building, City Landmark No. HS84-27, located on the southeast corner of South First and Santa Clara Streets (12 South First Street) in the Downtown Commercial National Register Historic District.

*VTA and the consulting architect (Dreyfuss & Assoc.) are studying options for station entrances, would like to present results to HLC, and then present a preferred option to the VTA board in June. Commissioner Cunningham noted that the B. of A. building's existing doorways seem small in relation to VTA's potential ridership volumes and the need for emergency egress. Commissioner Stabile raised concerns about the availability of funding for the project and a perceived lack of adequate consideration for other potential sites (e.g., Fountain Alley, Western Dental) for station entrances. Commissioner Thacker suggested the possible use of station entrances located on sidewalks rather than on building facades, as a way of minimizing impacts to buildings' historic integrity. Megan Bellue, PACSJ, described the perceived focus on the B. of A. building as seemingly premature and expressed concerns related to seismic safety upgrade impacts to the Resource.*

**6. PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS**

Public comments to the Historic Landmarks Commission on non-agendized items. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to two minutes. The Commission cannot take any formal action without the item being properly noticed and placed on an agenda. In response to public comment, the Historic Landmarks Commission is limited to the following options:

1. Responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public; or
2. Requesting staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting; or
3. Directing staff to place the item on a future agenda.

- a. Public Comment

*Bonnie Bamburg discussed a group of early workers' cabins that History San Jose accepted in 1995, but which have since been vandalized and not very accessible to the public. A pending proposal is to move them to a more advantageous location at the History San Jose site before a grant opportunity expires in May.*

## 7. **GOOD AND WELFARE**

### a. **Report from the Redevelopment Agency**

*The Redevelopment Agency is pursuing a new Exclusive Negotiations Agreement (ENA) with Barry Swenson Builders and San Jose Parking, for the development of the Fountain Alley site. The Exclusive Negotiations Agreement will be brought forward for Redevelopment Agency Board consideration in late May or June. When the ENA is brought forward to the Board, Agency staff will present economic and urban design issues related to varying heights of any prospective development proposal for Council discussion.*

### b. **Report from the Secretary**

#### i) Status of Circulation of Environmental Review Documents

<http://www.sanjoseca.gov/planning/eir/>

- Parkview Towers DEIR  
NOP distributed March 2006
- Morrison Park DEIR  
NOP distributed February 27, 2007
- Coyote Valley Specific Plan (CVSP) DEIR  
Circulation anticipated late March 2007

#### (ii) Status of HLC Recommendations on Referrals to City Council, Boards, Commissions, and Other Agencies

Lake House Historic District Nomination.

March 28, 2007 Planning Commission Hearing

April 17, 2007 City Council Hearing

PDC03-108. Planned Development Rezoning from A(PD) Planned Development Zoning District to A(PD) Planned Development Zoning District to allow up to 1,232 single-family residences and 304,920 square feet for commercial uses on the San Jose Flea Market 120.4 gross acre site.

February 21, 2007 DEIR referred to HLC

May 16, 2007 Planning Commission Hearing

June 5, 2007 City Council Hearing

PDC06-003. Lowe's Home Improvement Warehouse. Planned Development rezoning from IP(PD) Industrial Park zoning district to A(PD) Planned Development zoning district, including proposed demolition of IBM Building 025.

November 1, 2006 DEIR Referred to HLC

March 7, and March 21, 2007 Rezoning Referred to HLC

April 11, 2007 Planning Commission Hearing

May 1, 2007 City Council Hearing

**Staff Recommendation:**

Historic Landmarks Commission to consider selection of a liaison to speak at the Planning Commission and City Council hearings on behalf of the HLC.

*Commission selected Chairman Janke, with Commissioner Cunningham as alternate, to Commission; Chairman Janke, with Vice Chair Colombe as alternate, to City Council.*

(iii) 2006 Commissioners' Form 700 and Family Gift Reporting Form due to City Clerk April 2, 2007.

(iv) Preservation Month: May 2007.

**Staff Recommendation:**

Historic Landmarks Commission to consider designating a liaison to accept a Preservation Month Proclamation at the May 1, 2007 City Council hearing.

*Commissioner Stabile to serve as liaison to this hearing.*

(v) California Preservation Conference, May 3-6, 2007, Hollywood, CA.

**c. Report from Committees**

- History San Jose Collections Committee  
Commissioner Stabile, Liaison

*Upcoming event in the near future, TBD.*

- Coyote Valley Specific Plan and Habitat Conservation Plan Advisory Committee  
Commissioner Cunningham, Liaison

*DEIR under review; comment letter on specific plan is being prepared*

- Japantown Survey Committee  
Commissioner Lavelle, Liaison

*Another public outreach meeting soon, prior to acceptance of the survey by Council*

- Pellier Park Committee  
Commissioner Colombe, Liaison

*Historic Preservation Permit was filed by PRNS and is under review.*

- City of San Jose BART extension, Design, Art & Architecture Review  
Chair Janke, Liaison

*(Item on tonight's agenda)*

d. **Report from Historic Landmarks Commission Subcommittees**

- Design Review Committee (DRC)  
Commissioners Janke, Colombe and Cunningham, members

No March Meeting

8. **ADJOURNMENT**

## 2007 HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE

DATE	TIME	TYPE OF MEETING	LOCATION
No Meeting in January		Regular Meeting	
January 17, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
January 26, 2007	12:00 p.m. – 4:30 p.m.	HLC Retreat	Room T-1654
February 7, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
February 21, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Special Meeting/DRC Subcommittee	Room T-550
March 7, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
March 21, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Special Meeting	Room T-550
April 4, 2007	5:00 p.m.	Special Session	Room T-332
April 4, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
April 18, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	No Meeting
May 2, 2007	5:00 p.m.	Special Session	Room T-334
May 2, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
May 16, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
June 6, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
June 20, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
No Meeting in July		Regular meeting	
No Meeting		Design Review Subcommittee	
August 1, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
August 15, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
September 5, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
September 19, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
October 3, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
October 17, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
November 7, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
November 21, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
December 5, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
December 19, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550

HISTORIC LANDMARKS AGENDA ON THE WEB:  
<http://www.sanjoseca.gov/planning/hearings/historic.asp>